

Pathogenicity of *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* to Beans (*Phaseolus vulgaris*, L.) Cultivars

Ashraf A. Hatamleh¹, Mohamed El-sheshtawi²,
Abdallah M. Elgorban^{2,3}, Ali H. Bahkali¹ and Basheer A. Al-Sum^{1*}

¹Botany and Microbiology Department, College of Science, King Saud University,
P.O. Box 2455, Riyadh 11451, Saudi Arabia.

²Plant Pathology Department, College of Agriculture, Mansoura University, Mansoura, Egypt.

³Center of Excellence in Biotechnology Research, King Saud University,
P. O. Box 2455, Riyadh 11451, Saudi Arabia.

⁴Plant Pathology Institute, Agricultural Research Center, Giza, Egypt.

(Received: 20 September 2013; accepted: 06 November 2013)

Sclerotinia rot caused by *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* is a serious threat to green beans production in Egypt. The pathogenicity of this pathogen to 11 different cultivars was measured by survival plants % in the genotypes. Significant differences were observed between different cultivars ($P \leq 0.005$). Results indicate that, Amy and Giza cultivars were more susceptible to infection with *S. sclerotiorum* that produced 16% survival plants in both cultivars after 60 days. While, Duel cultivar was less sensitive to infection with the pathogen that giving 40% living plants at 60 days.

Key words: *Sclerotinia Sclerotiorum*, Pathogenicity, Beans.

Sclerotinia white rot caused by the ascomycete *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum*, is a serious hazard to green beans production with substantial yield losses from this disease recorded world-wide^{1,2,3}. While, *S. sclerotiorum* is considered to show little host specificity⁴, it is important to understand that the diversity of this pathogen to develop effective strategies to detect the identification and dissemination of host resistance. The pathogenicity and diversity studies of this fungus have been examined for different crops in the world^{5,6,7,8}. Several past studies have explored the genetic diversity of *S. sclerotiorum*^{3, 9,10,11,12}. Further, only limited studies have been conducted so far, to understand the diversity and pathogenicity of *S. sclerotiorum* on beans or other hosts in Egypt¹³. These include the work of Sexton *et al.*¹⁴ who

established genotypic diversity among *S. sclerotiorum* isolates collected from oilseed rape crops from Australia, utilizing microsatellite markers, and Ekinset *et al.*¹⁵, who compared aggressiveness of *S. sclerotiorum* isolates collected also from Australia on sunflower. Alterations in the morphology of *S. sclerotiorum* isolates have previously been noticed by Li *et al.*¹⁶ and Garrabrandt *et al.*¹⁷ where isolates producing tan sclerotia were identified. Very few reports exist to date describing darkly-pigmented isolates of *S. sclerotiorum*, such as those from Canada and the south-western region of the USA^{18,19}. Primarily, the dark color of the fungus colonies results from the construction of melanin, the main role of which in this pathogen is to protect the sclerotia from adverse biological and environmental conditions^{18,20}. An association of melanin with pathogenicity has also been reported in other pathogens. The objective of our study was to evaluate the pathogenicity of *S. sclerotiorum* from Ismailia governorate, Egypt to

* To whom all correspondence should be addressed.

selected genotypes of bean, under greenhouse conditions.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Sclerotinia sclerotiorum isolates

S. sclerotiorum was collected from Ismailia governorate, Egypt in 2008 and used in this study. The initial cultures were then sub-cultured on to water agar and stored at 4°C. All isolates were subsequently sub-cultured to potato dextrose agar (PDA) as this medium allows the best expression of any pigmentation occurring in *S. sclerotiorum* colonies^{18,20}.

In this experiment, we studied the pathogenicity of *S. sclerotiorum* to 11 bean cultivars. The experiment was conducted under greenhouse condition. Pots (30×25×30) containing sterile soil (sand: loamy sand: compost, 1:2:1) were used, 5 seeds/pot and 5 replicates per treatment. Seedlings were grown until cotyledons were fully expanded. Five agar plug discs (each 5 mm² diam) were cut from the actively growing margin of 3 day-old colonies of *S. sclerotiorum* on PDA at 20±2°C and transferred to 250 ml flasks containing 100 ml of sterilized potato dextrose broth. Flasks were incubated at 20±2 °C for 7 days, colonies of *S. sclerotiorum* were harvested and washed twice with sterilized deionized water. The mycelial suspension was then filtered through four layers of cheesecloth and the concentration adjusted with the same liquid medium to 1×10⁴cfu/ml using a haemocytometer. A total of 20 ml of mycelial

suspension were applied to pots. The number of survival plants after 15, 30, 45 and 60 days were recorded.

Statistical analysis

Data collected from all experiments were statistically analyzed using the Statistic Analysis System package (SAS institute, Cary, NC, USA). Differences between treatments were studied using Fisher's least significant difference (LSD) test and Duncan's Multiple Range Test²¹. All analysis were performed at P 5 % level.

RESULTS

Pathogenicity of *S. sclerotiorum* to different bean cultivars

After 15 days

Data in Table 1 and 2 reveal that no significant difference in degree of sensitivity for the tested cultivars to *S. sclerotiorum*. The genotype paulista was the lowest cultivar for sensitivity to *S. sclerotiorum* that giving 80% survival plants. This was followed by both sahel and amy which produced the same result with 72% survival plants. While, giza-4 cultivar was the most sensitivity to infection with the fungus, which produced 32% survival plants.

After 30 day

There were non-significant differences between all cultivars for sensitivity of the white rot disease caused by *S. sclerotiorum*. The variety duel was the best cultivar for tolerant to infestation by *S. sclerotiorum* that giving 60.00% living plants

Table 1. ANOVA

		Sum of Squares	df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
Survival plant after 15 days	Between Groups	27.636	10	2.764	3.663	0.001
	Within groups	33.200	44	0.755		
	Total	60.63610	54			
Survival plant after 30 days	Between Groups	14.436	10	1.444	3.452	0.002
	Within groups	14.800	44	0.418		
	Total	32.836	54			
Survival plant after 45 days	Between Groups	14.109	10	1.411	3.979	0.001
	Within groups	15.600	44	0.355		
	Total	29.709	54			
Survival plant after 60 days	Between Groups	6.182	10	0.618	2.061	0.049
	Within groups	13.200	44	0.300		
	Total	19.382	54			

Table 2. Pathogenicity of *S. sclerotiorum* to different bean cultivars.

Treatment	15 days			30 days			45 days			60 days		
	No.	Mo. %	Sur.%									
Sahel	3.6bc	28.0	72.0	2.2bcde	28.0	44.0	2.2bc	56.0	44.0	1.4ab	16.0	28.0
Mael	2.8ab	44.0	56.0	2.0ab	16.0	40.0	1.6ab	68.0	32.0	1.4ab	4.0	28.0
Duel	3.4bc	32.0	68.0	3.0d	8.0	60.0	2.6c	48.0	52.0	2.0b	12.0	40.0
Samantha	2.4ab	52.0	48.0	1.4ab	20.0	28.0	1.2ab	76.0	24.0	1.0a	4.0	20.0
Belina	3.4bc	32.0	68.0	2.4cde	20.0	48.0	1.6ab	68.0	32.0	1.4ab	4.0	28.0
Paulista	3.0bc	40.0	60.0	2.6de	8.0	52.0	1.6ab	68.0	32.0	1.4ab	4.0	28.0
Branco	4.0d	20.0	80.0	2.4cde	32.0	48.0	1.6ab	68.0	32.0	1.2a	8.0	24.0
Amy	3.6bc	28.0	72.0	1.6ab	40.0	32.0	0.8a	84.0	16.0	0.8a	0.0	16.0
Julia	2.6ab	48.0	52.0	2.0ab	12.0	40.0	1.4ab	72.0	28.0	1.0a	8.0	20.0
SB4070	2.0ab	60.0	40.0	1.8ab	4.0	36.0	1.4ab	72.0	28.0	1.0a	8.0	20.0
Giza-4	1.6a	68.0	32.0	1.2a	8.0	24.0	0.8a	84.0	16.0	0.8a	0.0	16.0
LSD	071			0.53			0.49			0.45		

No. = Number of living plants; Mo. % = Mortality percentage; Sur. % = Survival plant%
 Values within a column followed by the same letter are not significantly different according to Duncun's multiple range test (P£0.05).

when compared to other cultivars. These were followed by paulista and branco with 52 and 48% survival plants, respectively. Whereas, the most cultivar for sensitivity to the white rot disease was giza-4 and Samantha giving 24 and 28 survival plants (Table 1 and 2).

After 45 day

There were non-significant differences between among all cultivars to sensitivity of the white rot disease caused by *S. sclerotiorum* (Table 1 and 2). The lowest cultivar for sensitivity was duel which produced 52% survival plants, when compared to other cultivars, followed by sahel that giving 44% survival plants. Conversely, the cultivars amy and giza-4 were the most cultivars sensitivity to the fungus that giving 16% survival plants in both cultivars.

After 60 day

There were non-significant differences between all cultivars tested. The duel cultivar was the lowest cultivar for sensitivity to *S. sclerotiorum* which produced 40% survival plants, followed by sahel, mael, belina and paulista that giving the same result (28% survival plants). While, the cultivars amy and giza-4 were the most sensitivity for the white rot disease caused by *S. sclerotiorum* giving 16% living plants in both cultivars (Table 1 and 2).

This finding is consistent with other reports for the pathogenicity of *S. sclerotiorum* to several crops^{23,23}. Usually, the strong defense against the wild-type strain of *S. sclerotiorum* at the early stage of infection is not noticeable, which means that the defense is most likely to be suppressed or postponed by this pathogen. If suppression is a means by which *S. sclerotiorum* is successful as a pathogen, then it is not surprising that *S. sclerotiorum* may secrete pathogenicity factors to aid in the suppression of host resistance. Previous studies on the pathogenicity of plant pathogenic fungi generally focus on toxins (including proteinaceous effectors), proteinases and plant cell degrading enzymes such as pectinases and cellulase (EC 3.2.1.4, endo-1,4-beta-D-glucanase, beta-1,4-glucanase, beta-1,4-endoglucan hydrolase, cellulase A, cellulose AP, endoglucanase)^{24,25}. Oxalic acid is considered a key pathogenicity factor for the killing of plant cells and tissues by *S. sclerotiorum*, and it is also involved in reducing host resistance and interjecting the host physiology rather than as

adirect killer^{25,26,27,28}. However, this topic is also one of increasing complexity; several mutants of *S. sclerotiorum* produce considerable amounts of oxalic acid, but do not infect the plant, but virulence is weak²⁹; in addition, the mutant cannot produce oxalic acid, but can still infect plant³⁰. Recently, Williams *et al*²⁹ confirmed that reactive oxygen species was virtually absent in DAB stained leaf inoculated with the wild-type strain of *S. sclerotiorum*, while leaves inoculated with an oxalic acid deficient mutant A2 displayed strong DAB staining surrounding the infection point, and they believed that oxalic acid suppresses host defenses by manipulating the host redox environment at 8 hpi, an early stage of infection.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This project was supported by King Saud University, Deanship of Scientific Research, College of Science Research Center. I would like to express my sincere gratitude and deep gratefulness to all our colleagues of the Department of Botany and Microbiology, King Saud University for their valuable criticism and advice.

REFERENCES

- Hind, T. L., Ash, G. J., Murray, G. M., Prevalence of *Sclerotinia* stem rot of canola in New South Wales. *Aus. J. Exp. Agr.*, 2003, **43**: 163–168.
- Koch, S., Dunker, S., Kleinhenz, B., Rohrig, M., von Tiedemann, A., A crop loss-related forecasting model for *Sclerotinia* stem rot in winter oilseed rape. *Phytopathol.*, 2007, **97**: 1186–1194.
- Malvarez, M., Carbone, I., Grunwald, N.J., Subbarao, K.V., Schafer, M., Kohn, L.M., New populations of *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* from lettuce in California and peas and lentils in Washington. *Phytopathol.*, 2007, **97**: 470–483.
- Purdy, L.H., *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum*: history, diseases and symptomatology, host range, geographic distribution and impact. *Phytopathology*, 1979, **69**: 875–880.
- Auclair, J., Boland, G.J., Kohn, L.M., & Rajcan, I., Genetic interaction between Glycine max and *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* using a straw inoculation method. *Plant Dis.*, 2004, **88**: 891–895.
- Hambleton, S., Walker, C., & Kohn, L. M., Clonal lineages of *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* previously known from other crops predominate in 1999–2000 samples from Ontario and Quebec soybean. *Can. J. Plant Pathol.*, 2002, **24**: 309–315.
- Maltby, A.D., Mihail, J.D., Competition among *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* genotypes within canola stems. *Can. J. Bot.*, 1997, **75**: 462–468.
- Kull, L.S., Vuong, T.D., Powers, K.S., Eskridge, K.M., Steadman, J.R., Hartman, G.L., Evaluation of resistance screening methods for *Sclerotinia* stem rot of soybean and dry bean. *Plant Dis.*, 2003, **87**: 1471–1476.
- Kohn, L.M., Stasovski, E., Carbone, I., Royer, J., Anderson, J.B., Mycelial incompatibility and molecular markers identify genetic variability in field populations of *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum*. *Phytopathol.*, 1991, **81**: 480–485.
- Kohli, Y., Morrall, R.A.A., Anderson, J.B., Kohn, L.M., Local and trans-Canadian clonal distribution of *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* on canola. *Phytopathol.*, 1992, **82**: 875–880.
- Cubeta, M.A., Cody, B.R., Kohli, Y., Kohn, L.M., Clonality in *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* on infected cabbage in eastern North Carolina. *Phytopathol.*, 1997, **87**: 1000–1004.
- Sun, J. M., Irzykowski, W., Jedryczka, M., Han, F. X. (2005). Analysis of the genetic structure of *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* (Lib.) de Bary populations from different regions and host plants by random amplified polymorphic DNA markers. *J. Int. Plant Biol.*, 2005, **47**: 385–395.
- Elgorban A.M., Al-Sum, B.A., Elsheshtawi, M., Bahkali, A.H. Factors affecting on *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* isolated from beans growing in Ismailia, Egypt. *Life Sci J*, 2013; **10**: 1278–1282
- Sexton, A.C., Whitten, A.R., Howlett, B.J., Population structure of *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* in an Australian canola field at flowering and stem-infection stages of the disease cycle. *Genome*, 2006, **49**: 1408–1415.
- Ekins, M.G., Aitken, E.A.B., Goulter, K.C., Aggressiveness among isolates of *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* from sunflower. *Aus. Plant Pathol.*, 2007, **36**, 580–586.
- Li, G.Q., Huang, H.C., Laroche, A., Acharaya, S. N., Occurrence and characterization of hypovirulence in the tan sclerotial isolates of S10 of *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum*. *Mycol. Res.*, 2003, **107**: 1350–1360.
- Garrabrandt, L.E., Johnston, S.A., Peterson, J.L., Tan sclerotia of *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* from lettuce. *Mycologia*, 1983, **75**: 451–456.
- Lazarovits, G., Starratt, A.N., Huang, H.C., The effect of tricyclazole and culture medium on production of the melanin precursor 1, 8-dihydroxynaphthalene by *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* isolate SS7. *Pest. Bioch. Physiol.*, 2000, **67**: 54–62.

19. Sanogo, S., Puppala, N., Characterization of darkly pigmented mycelial isolates of *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* on Valencia peanut in New Mexico. *Plant Dis.*, 2007, **91**: 1077–1082.
20. Butler, M. J., & Day, A. W. Fungal melanins: a review. *Can J Microbiol.*, 1998; **44**, 1115–1136.
21. Duncan DB, Multiple ranges and multiple F tests. *Biometrics*, 1955, **11**: 1–42.
22. Bolton MD, Thomma BPHJ, Nelson BD. *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* (Lib.) de Bary: biology and molecular traits of a cosmopolitan pathogen. *Mol Plant Pathol*, 2006; **7**: 1–16.
23. Kim KS, Min JY, Dickman MB. Oxalic acid is an elicitor of plant programmed cell death during *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* disease development. *Molecular Plant–Microbe Interactions*, 2008; **21**, 605–612.
24. Riou, C., Freyssinet, G., Fevre, M., Purification and characterization of extracellular pectinolytic enzymes produced by *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum*. *Appl Environ Microbiol.*, 1992, **58**: 578–583.
25. Cessna, S.G., Sears, V.E., Dickman, M.B., Low, P.S., Oxalic acid, a pathogenicity factor for *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum*, suppresses the oxidative burst of the host plant. *Plant Cell*, 2000, **12**: 2191–2200.
26. Kim, K.S., Min, J.Y., Dickman, M.B., Oxalic acid is an elicitor of plant programmed cell death during *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* disease development. *Mol. Plant Microbe Interact.*, 2008, **21**: 605–612.
27. Williams, B., Kabbage, M., Kim, H.J., Britt, R., Dickman, M.B., Tipping the balance: *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* secreted oxalic acid suppresses host defenses by manipulating the host redox environment. *PLoS Pathog*, 2011, **7**: e1002107.
28. Guimaraes, R.L., Stotz, H.U., Oxalate production by *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* deregulates guard cells during infection. *Plant Physiol.*, 2004, **136**: 3703–3711.
29. Li, G.Q., Jiang, D.H., Zhou, B., Wang, D., Rimmer, R., Oxalic acid production in hypovirulent and virulent strains of *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum*. In: Proceedings of International Symposium on Rapeseed Science. Ed by Liu Houli and Fu Tingdong, Science Press, New York., 2001, 261–270.
30. Xu, L.S., Xiang, M., White, D., Chen, W.D., Oxalate-minus mutants of *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* via random mutagenesis retain pathogenicity. *Phytopathol.*, 2001, **101**: S104.
31. AL-Shammari Turki A, Bahkali Ali H, Elgorban Abdallah M, El-Kahky Maged T and Al-Sum Basheer A. The Use of *Trichoderma longibrachiatum* and *Mortierella alpina* Against Root-Knot Nematode, *Meloidogyne javanica* on Tomato. *J Pure Appl Microbio*, 2013; **7**(Spl Edition Nov): 199-207.
32. Elgorban Abdallah M, Bahkali Ali H and Al-Sum Basheer A. Biological Control of Root Rots and Stems Canker of Tomato Plants Caused by *Rhizoctonia solani* in Saudi Arabia. *J Pure Appl Microbio*, 2013; **7**(Spl Edition Nov): 819-826.